Infrastructures of Karma

an Inquiry into Attention Metrification and Attention Dynamics in Reddit
The medium is the message

The “message” of any medium or technology is the change of scale or pace or pattern that it introduces into human affairs.


"It isn't that I don't like current events. There have just been so many of them lately."

The medium is the message (literally)
Why Reddit?

virality-oriented platforms

solution-oriented platforms


Three sub-projects

1. Instant Karma
   or Reddit *metrics* and their consequences

2. Karma Chameleon
   or the *dynamics* of attention in Reddit

3. Karma Police
   or *moderation* activities in Reddit
1. Instant Karma
Reddit metrics and their consequences

- What metrics are used in Reddit to rank
  - users (post k., comments k., awards, trophies...)
  - content (hot, controversial, top, rising...)
  - Subreddits (number of subscribers, ...)

- How are these metrics computed?

- What behaviours are incentivised and dis-incentivised by these metrics?
1. Instant Karma

Reddit metrics and their consequences

subredditstats.com (subscribers, comments, growth)
redditmetrics.com (some historical data)
snoopsnoo.com (users rather threads analytics)

www.reddit.com/r/TheoryOfReddit/
www.reddit.com/r/AgainstKarmaWhores/
www.reddit.com/r/AgainstKarmaWhores/comments/3gwmae/types_of_karma_whores/


2. Karma Chameleon
or the **dynamics** of attention in Reddit

- Can we trace how threads (but also subreddits & users) evolve through time in terms of
  - Ranking/visibility?
  - Activity (comments, votes...)?
  - 'Quality' of the conversation?

- Are there different trajectories to success and failure?

- Are there events that mark Reddit trajectories
  - Thresholds
  - Particular type of interventions (e.g. trolling...)
  - Moderation intervention
2. Karma Chameleon
or the dynamics of attention in Reddit

redditinsight.com (users, single posts)
dashboard.laterforreddit.com/analysis/ (time of the day)


3. Karma Police
or moderation activities in Reddit

- How moderator
  - users (post k., comments k., awards, trophies...)
  - content (hot, controversial, top, rising...)
  - Subreddits (number of subscribers, ....)

- What forms of manual moderation are employed in Reddits? With what consequences?

- What forms of automatic moderation are employed in Reddits? With what consequences?

- What kind of users are Reddits moderators?
3. Karma Police

or moderation activities in Reddit

https://modlogs.fyi
https://chrome.google.com/webstore/detail/moderator-toolbox-for-
red/jhipjhhkcbkmkdahnckfboefnkgghpo

https://www.reddit.com/wiki/moderation
https://mods.reddithelp.com/hc/en-us/articles/360008425592-Mod-
eration-Tools-overview


On infrastructures


On platforms as infrastructures


On attention infrastructures and their consequences


### KutakuInAction moderation logs

#### modlog for /r/KotakuInAction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ID</th>
<th>Username</th>
<th>Vote</th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Date/Time</th>
<th>Reason</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Distragged</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td><em>Ban</em></td>
<td>2023-01-21 16:05:31</td>
<td><em>User has been removed for the following reasons:</em> &quot;Discrimination against my personal beliefs&quot;. Please refer to the /r/KotakuInAction rules page for more information.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Blurred</td>
<td>0</td>
<td><em>Ban</em></td>
<td>2023-01-21 16:05:31</td>
<td><em>User has been removed for the following reasons:</em> &quot;Discrimination against my personal beliefs&quot;. Please refer to the /r/KotakuInAction rules page for more information.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Flair-Stripped</td>
<td>0</td>
<td><em>Ban</em></td>
<td>2023-01-21 16:05:31</td>
<td><em>User has been removed for the following reasons:</em> &quot;Discrimination against my personal beliefs&quot;. Please refer to the /r/KotakuInAction rules page for more information.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>UserDeleted</td>
<td>0</td>
<td><em>Ban</em></td>
<td>2023-01-21 16:05:31</td>
<td><em>User has been removed for the following reasons:</em> &quot;Discrimination against my personal beliefs&quot;. Please refer to the /r/KotakuInAction rules page for more information.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

[https://moddit-2a511.firebaseapp.com/r/KotakuInAction](https://moddit-2a511.firebaseapp.com/r/KotakuInAction)

Logs for [https://www.reddit.com/r/KotakuInAction](https://www.reddit.com/r/KotakuInAction)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C Date</th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Action type</th>
<th>Moderator Name</th>
<th>Moderator Type</th>
<th>Moderated User</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Feb 21, 2019, 10:04:01 AM</td>
<td>Comment Removed</td>
<td>Removed</td>
<td>AutoModerator</td>
<td>Bot</td>
<td>papaKiiro12</td>
<td>scalio is irrelevant as over these days</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 4 | 5 | Feb 21, 2019, 10:02:11 AM | Post Marked As Spam | Marked As Spam | Notatant13  | Limited permissions | papaKiiro12 | they will be even more pissed when this ghost busters is over.
| 6 | 7 | Feb 21, 2019, 9:52:57 AM | Comment Approved | Approved     | pkinebe2e    | Full permissions | papaKiiro12 | How is the article wrong though? Anyone who is unironic |
| 8 | 9 | Feb 21, 2019, 9:52:34 AM | Comment Approved | Approved     | Notatant13  | Limited permissions | papaKiiro12 | maybe if ms brie larson wouldn't have made public statement, |
| 10 | 11 | Feb 21, 2019, 9:46:31 AM | Comment Removed | Removed     | AutoModerator   | Bot            | papaKiiro12    | they will be even more pissed when this ghost busters is over.
| 12 | 13 | Feb 21, 2019, 9:35:39 AM | Comment Removed | Removed     | AutoModerator   | Bot            | waterhand      | How is the article wrong though? Anyone who is unironic |
| 14 | 15 | Feb 21, 2019, 9:25:46 AM | Distinguished   | Distinguished | pike2ke2e    | Full permissions | pike2ke2e     | that's not how 'related Politics' works. it has to be something |
| 16 | 17 | Feb 21, 2019, 9:23:58 AM | Comment Removed | Removed     | AutoModerator   | Bot            | papaKiiro12    | maybe if ms brie larson wouldn't have made public statement |
| 18 | 19 | Feb 21, 2019, 9:23:15 AM | Comment Approved | Approved     | Brinshah     | Full permissions | JustOneAmongMany | How about I fart twice in your general direction? In all seri |
| 20 | 21 | Feb 21, 2019, 9:23:01 AM | Comment Approved | Approved     | Brinshah     | Full permissions | papaKiiro12    | the 5 users of edge will be shocked they are being spied on |
| 22 | 23 | Feb 21, 2019, 9:21:26 AM | Comment Removed | Removed     | AutoModerator   | Bot            | papaKiiro12    | the 5 users of edge will be shocked they are being spied on |
| 24 | 25 | Feb 21, 2019, 9:18:14 AM | Comment Approved | Approved     | Notatant13  | Limited permissions | papaKiiro12 | he probably means giving the fans what they want: an act |
| 26 | 27 | Feb 21, 2019, 9:17:56 AM | Comment Removed | Removed     | AutoModerator   | Bot            | papaKiiro12    | he probably means giving the fans what they want: an act |
| 28 | 29 | Feb 21, 2019, 9:17:49 AM | Comment Removed | Removed     | Notatant13  | Limited permissions | cyrus2k6     | None. The allegations mardy and the others relate as are |
| 30 | 31 | Feb 21, 2019, 9:17:23 AM | Comment Approved | Approved     | Notatant13  | Limited permissions | Blackswan    | just because someone is horrible I’m not going to rub my |
| 32 | 33 | Feb 21, 2019, 9:16:53 AM | Comment Approved | Approved     | Notatant13  | Limited permissions | papaKiiro12 | this is the one of the main reasons why content designers |
| 34 | 35 | Feb 21, 2019, 9:14:18 AM | Comment Removed | Removed     | AutoModerator   | Bot            | papaKiiro12    | this is the one of the main reasons why content designers |
| 36 | 37 | Feb 21, 2019, 9:14:15 AM | Distinguished   | Distinguished | pike2ke2e    | Full permissions | pike2ke2e     | archive link of the actual twitter. I'm not sure who put it into |
| 38 | 39 | Feb 21, 2019, 9:14:15 AM | Distinguished   | Distinguished | pike2ke2e    | Full permissions | pike2ke2e     | archive link of the actual twitter I'm not sure who put it into |
| 40 | 41 | Feb 21, 2019, 9:13:09 AM | Comment Approved | Approved     | Notatant13  | Limited permissions | CautiousAddiction | Romania became communist due to communist jews in Romania. |
| 42 | 43 | Feb 21, 2019, 9:13:08 AM | Comment Approved | Approved     | Notatant13  | Limited permissions | CautiousAddiction | These people must be purged from the West before they |
| 44 | 45 | Feb 21, 2019, 9:12:27 AM | Comment Approved | Approved     | Notatant13  | Limited permissions | papaKiiro12    | I mean its quite well known that in the social science academy |
| 46 | 47 | Feb 21, 2019, 9:12:21 AM | Comment Approved | Approved     | AutoModerator   | Bot            | papaKiiro12    | this is the one of the main reasons why content designers |

https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1GzhZfC8VZCCijDTYNT8zU1pPconq5iIMFrGV9FdfsNRA/edit#gid=2027022984
## Kotaku in Action moderation logs - pivot table & chart

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Full permissions</th>
<th>Limited permissions</th>
<th>Bot</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Approved</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>123</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distinguished</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>24</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flair Edited</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marked As Spam</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Removed</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sticky Moderated</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>User Moderated</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiki Edited</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Full permissions VS Limited permissions VS bot]

[Google Sheets Link: https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1GzhZfC8VZCCijDTYNT8zU1pPconq5iIMFrGV9FdfNRA/edit#gid=1494845917]
“Tier 1, 2, and 3 restrictions can all be bypassed by archiving. Go to https://archive.is and make an archive before posting if you want to avoid moderation delays or rejections.”

**TIER 1**

“Has a questionable history, but probably OK. Mods may ask for an archive on a case-by-case basis”

- HeatStreet
- DailyKos
- Gamespot
- ESPN
- Variety
- Wall Street Journal

**TIER 2**

“Numerous issues, but the situation is complex. Requires mod approval before post appears.”

- ABC (AUS)
- AusGamers
- BBC
- Breitbart
- The Independent
- DailyMail
- Plus another 16 websites

**TIER 3**

“Numerous issues. Either a strong Anti-GG stance or such serious ethical issues that archive is required. You can argue for the direct link in modmail, but allowances will be rare.”

- BuzzFeed
- A.V. Club
- CNN
- Daily Stormer
- Vice
- Huffington Post
- Plus another 69 websites

https://www.reddit.com/r/KotakuInAction/wiki/index/lists
Kotaku in Action - Moderator Requirements

The moderation team is looking to recruit a few extra moderators to join us in our ongoing efforts to make this subreddit and our community the place to be when it comes to issues pertaining to our mission statement. In particular we are looking for two more sets of hands to help during early morning US/early afternoon EU hours (generally 0500 EST/1000 Zulu onward) and weekends.

Being a mod on KotakuInAction isn’t an easy task. You have to be vigilant, stay up-to-date on current events and be able to communicate effectively with both our community and the rest of the mod team.

If you’re interested, we encourage you to read on and send your application our way!

Responsibilities include:

- Enforcing both the KotakuInAction local rules and Reddit global rules
- Responding to and addressing modmails
- Making sure posts have proper flair
- Coordinate judgment calls with existing moderators
- Participate in improving the KotakuInAction design, links, wiki, stylesheet, and config

Requirements

- It is required that the account you are applying with be at least 6 months old (created before 0001Z 09-Jul-2018) and have participated on the sub for roughly the same period of time. If you believe you should be exempt from this requirement for whatever reason, please include an explanation in your application.
- Demonstrate a history of participation in good faith on KotakuInAction
- You will be required to regularly participate in the KotakuInAction moderation group’s Discord text channels (voice is completely optional, we mostly use it for gaming, not moderating.)
- Willing to install and use the Reddit modtool browser extension
- You’re willing to do it for free. No salary negotiations. If I can’t get Hot Pockets, then I damn sure won’t let a couple of upstarts get Hot Pockets.
- Able to moderate during early morning US/early afternoon EU hours (this is one of the more important qualifications this time around) and at least one day on weekends
- Have a thick skin for the inevitable shit-flinging that comes from our fanclub just for being a moderator here

Your application should contain the following information:

- Brief bio about you and your time on RIA, how long you’ve been here, etc.
- Your location/timezone and how often you’re on Reddit
- Any experience moderating subreddits or other online communities, if applicable
- What you can do for KotakuInAction and what would make you a good moderator

https://www.reddit.com/r/KotakuInAction/comments/ae9u0p/its_getting_to_be_that_time_again_time_to_find/
Kotaku in Action - Posting Restrictions on Forum-goers

[Image of Reddit submission form]

WARNING: If you comment or post on KotakuInAction (regardless of the content), a number of other subreddits' moderators will automatically ban you from their subreddits. (/r/OffMyChest, /r/Rape (advice for victims of sexual violence), /r/NaturalHair, and others)

Totalitarians generally aren't known for their finesse.

You are submitting a link. The key to a successful submission is interesting content and a descriptive title.

When posting to /r/KotakuInAction: Your account MUST be older than 3 days. Please read the rules before posting. You can find the rules in the sidebar. Your post may be deleted automatically if it breaks one or more rules. When in doubt, message the moderators by using the button in the bottom of the sidebar.

https://www.reddit.com/r/KotakuInAction/submit
Kotaku in Action - Moderation of Forum-goers

Moderation by User

Moderation by Auto-moderator

https://www.reddit.com/r/KotakuInAction/comments/asoo4n/nikki_haley_on_jussie_smollett_he_must_be_held/ &
https://www.reddit.com/r/KotakuInAction/comments/as9zix/ubisoft_betrays_siege_community_reintroduces/
Kotaku in Action - Moderation of Forum-goers

The Red Pill seniority tags

Endorsement Seniority

The different levels of endorsement are as follows:

- **Endorsed Contributor**: Endorsed contributors are members who have demonstrated a strong grasp of core Red Pill ideas. Their comments and posts are frequently in line with the fundamental ideas necessary to live free of shackles.

- **Senior Endorsed**: Senior endorsed contributors began as endorsed contributors, and have remained active within the community for a long time. In addition to insightful comments, senior contributors often have a colorful posting history of informative and original content that is well worth reading. Because of their long participation and deep investment in the group, they have all but mastered the principles of the Red Pill. Senior contributors have been vetted TWICE, so you know that their words carry serious wisdom.

- **Red Pill Vanguard**: The Vanguard members come from the first generation of ORIGINAl endorsed contributors - these guys are the oldest members and have been here since the beginning. Their contributions comprise a lot of what is now the backbone of this community. Vanguard members are not vetted - they are the ones who do the vetting. In some cases, they even selected which of us mods would help govern the community. When a Vanguard speaks, what you are reading is pure unfiltered Red Pill.

There are also special community members who wear unique flair related to their Manosphere handles: men like Rollo Tomassi from The Rational Male, Ian Ironwood from The Red Pill Room, and GayLubeOil. These men should likewise be treated as sages in their own right. The community would not exist without them.

Point Flair

From time to time, you may also have noticed little numbers next to the names of certain users. These are flair points. Points are awarded to users by ECs for insightful comments and constructive participation. While points do not represent official endorsement, a user with a high point count is well on the road to a full endorsement, so be on the lookout for these men on the rise.

https://www.reddit.com/r/TheRedPill/comments/4ekpvg/endorsed_contributors_respect_the_tag/
TheRedPill seniority tags - pivot table

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Row Labels</th>
<th>Number of posts</th>
<th>Average of score</th>
<th>% of controversial</th>
<th>% of is submitter</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Normal users</td>
<td>19813</td>
<td>8,1</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>human moderators</td>
<td>381</td>
<td>2,6</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vanguard users</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>22,3</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>senior users</td>
<td>390</td>
<td>12,4</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>endorsed users</td>
<td>443</td>
<td>15,6</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>users with flair points</td>
<td>1524</td>
<td>15,8</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gaylube</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>13,4</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

https://drive.google.com/open?id=1AAM5aVmQZIlTeSg00AUEq32CwFEyswV9
TheRedPill seniority tags - pivot table

https://drive.google.com/open?id=1AAM5aVmQZIlTeSg00AUEq32CwFEyswV9
TheRedPill Users Network - all users

Size by InDegree

https://drive.google.com/open?id=1QYUUMT0FCHa6gxt9Sh7Z7WkkiDwv2ein
BrainCells Users Network
all users

https://drive.google.com/open?id=1IxwmPcQ4slQFKRMU-EsL61G9FHXD7F02
TheRedPill Users Network - tagged users

Size by InDegree
https://drive.google.com/open?id=1fb0mkdku9glY1_qY-025S7OsHpsGfy28

Size by OutDegree
TheRedPill Users Network - comments colored by users type

https://drive.google.com/open?id=1XuhXcwgdMXFQb0nTR6msffFh_aN7q13b
The Red Pill Moderators and Vanguard Users Text Sentiment
Red Pill Score of Moderators Comments (12 months)
Top and bottom scored distinguished comments

Top score:

Moderator allowing a post, even though it technically breaks sub rules.

Bottom score:

Moderator banning participant for sixty days following critique of moderation practices.
Red Pill Score of All Comments (12 months)
RedPill -- AutoModerator generic comments

[1] "Your above submission to /r/TheRedPill has been removed, because you have a new account with little karma. Please lurk and contribute more in discussion before posting a new submission. You may also visit /r/askTRP if you have questions related to being new to the red pill."

[2] "Your above submission to /r/TheRedPill has been removed, because you have a new account with little karma. Please lurk and contribute more in discussion before posting a new submission. You may also visit /r/askTRP if you have questions related to being new to the red pill. Please review this [memo on modmail](https://www.reddit.com/r/TheRedPill/comments/80kgg6/shit_to_avoid_saying_in_modmail/) before sending anything to the moderators. I am a bot, and this action was performed automatically. Please [contact the moderators of this subreddit](/message/compose/?to=/r/TheRedPill) if you have any questions or concerns."

[3] "Your submission has been removed because direct video links are not allowed. Please re-submit as a text self-post along with your analysis of the video."

[4] "Your submission to /r/TheRedPill has been removed. **[DO NOT CONTACT MODS, WE WILL NOT REVERSE THIS DECISION](https://www.reddit.com/r/TheRedPill/comments/80kgg6/shit_to_avoid_saying_in_modmail/)** You have a new account with little karma. Please lurk and contribute more. **READ THE SIDEBAR**."

[5] "Your submission has been removed because direct image links are not allowed."

[6] "Just a friendly reminder that as [TRP has been quarantined](https://www.trp.red), we have developed backup sites: [https://www.trp.red](https://www.trp.red) and our full post archive (and future forums) [https://www.forums.red/i/TheRedPill](https://www.forums.red/i/TheRedPill). Don't forget to register on TRP.RED and reserve your reddit name today. Forums.Red is currently locked but will be opened soon."
"raping", "hope you die", "hope you get cancer", "gas them", "ER", "E.R.", "slit your throat", "cut them", "split her skull open", "slit their throats", "strangle you", "you deserve rape", "acid thrown on", "acid on her face", "acid attack", "throw acid", "acidfacing", "okay with the rapes", "urge to rape", "rape them", "rape should be legal", "raping women", "rapefuel", "the hero we need", "beat their face", "punch them", "punch her face", "lynch them", "choke them", "need to die", "should die", "need to be put down", "need to be gassed", "need to be g4ssed", "gas chamber", "I hope they die", "kill them", "need to be shot", "could suffer", "blowing them up", "beat to a pull", "chokes to death", "stab you", "beats her", "should be executed", "mass killing", "killing spree", "killers", "defile her", "drugging women", "kill a woman", "bash her face in", "bash his head in", "I killed", "jump off a building", "get vanned", "sold as cattle", "smack his head", "glock", "mutilate", "hit by a truck", "homicide fuel", "wife beaters", "vanfuel", "beat", "beating", "get run over", "stoning", "death", "burn alive", "burned", "I hope she", "stab", "stabbed", "killed", "eliminate", "executed", "eliminated", "slave girls", "circumcised", "female circumcision", "Toronto", "morocco", "lashes", "lashings", "kys", "should commit suicide", "rope yourself", "neck yourself", "kill urself", "off yourself", "die slut", "jump off a bridge", "play in traffic", "go rope", "die incel", "do a livestream", "livestream it", "do the rope", "hang yourself", "just rope", "exit kit", "exit bag", "mass suicide", "shotgun", "slit your wrists" "ctb", "rape", "r@pe", "rapê", "räpe", "rap", "raped", "kill", "killing", "killer", "rapist", "r-a-p-i-s-t", "shooter", "rampage", "genocide", "ISIS", "lynch", "van rental", "kidnap", "shootings", "exit kit", "chloroform", "gang raped", "brutally raped", "executed", "mass shooting", "shotgun", "molest", "guillotine", "burn alive", "manifesto", "acidfaced", "dead bodies", "should die", "prime age", "need to die", "Alex", "with a girl", "my gf", "my girlfriend", "my wife", "braziliansigma", "my life goal", "I am banging", "I'm banging", "I'm fucking", "dies", "most of us", "most of you" "saint Cruz", "st. cruz", "saint Ramirez", "st. ramirez", "supreme gentleman", "Elliot", "Rodger", "minassian", "cho", "Marc lepine", "saint lepine", "st. Lepine", "my van" "this is why you're a virgin", "no wonder you can't get laid", "no wonder you are incel", "no wonder you're incel", "pathetic virgin", "virgin loser"